

**Oregon International Port of Coos Bay  
Marine Reserves Recommendation Committee  
December 13, 2010**

**Reedsport – Reedsport High School Cafeteria  
Town Hall Public Comments**

Public Commenters: Lou Otherby – Corvallis; Elton Beach – Lakeside; Joseph Blackwell – Lakeside; Leo Naapi – Reedsport; CWT Clay – Coos Bay; Lou Leberti – Coos Bay; Bob Borst – Eugene; Paul Walker – Eugene; Erin Anderson – Portland; Rachel Smith – Eugene; Allen Solomon – Coos Bay; Laura Schmidt – Portland; Stephen Karakashian – Portland; George Barton – Coos Bay; Edgar Bowen – Coos Bay; Mark Tilton – Florence; Laura Smith – Reedsport; Anita Andolza – Coos Bay

Lou Otherby – Corvallis

Mr. Otherby said he represented the Sierra Club both statewide and in the city of Corvallis. He said that around the temperate zones of the world Marine Reserves have brought positive economic benefits from the new non-consumptive users coming into an area. He said he saw this in Northern California, where he used to live, at the Año Nuevo Nature Reserve. There were elephant seals in much greater numbers than there are here, but, he said, the future is always possible. He said as of October 1 every year at Año Nuevo they started getting phone calls for people willing to pay \$10 for parking and \$6 for a hike, with a trained docent for groups of 20 leaving every 15 minutes from 9 a.m. until 3 p.m. He said it's no more special than what is going on at Cape Arago. He said he was at Cape Arago today looking at a group of Steller sea lions in the middle of the California sea lions. He said he walked down to the beach and sat for an hour watching a pair of harlequin ducks and wondered what could be more wonderful on an afternoon. He said the Sierra Club believes the most effective enforcement tool is education. He said the Corvallis-area club leads 150 outings a year, with a third of them going to the coast. They bring people from the Willamette Valley to show them what is going on and show them why Marine Reserves and Marine Protected Areas protecting the ocean are so important.

Elton Beach – Lakeside

Mr. Beach said he believes the opposite of Mr. Otherby. He said he believes the United States have fallen into a situation of too many regulations, and that agencies are slapping on more regulations and limiting more areas. He said there are many good areas here for people to fish and scientists don't need to have an area blocked off to do a study. He said Mr. Otherby saw two different kinds of seals and beautiful birds where there is no reserve. Why do we need a reserve? He said he was having a terrible time understanding the psychology of organizations except that they are money grabbers with big donations and big wages. He felt it had very little to do with the preservation of wildlife.

LeRoy Schoeppel – Lakeside

He passed from making comment because he agreed with Mr. Beach's comments.

Joseph Blackwell – Lakeside

Mr. Blackwell said he is a sport fisherman who enjoys recreational fishing. Some of the areas that are being proposed are particularly popular for fishing. He feels studies are fine, but told the committee not to take away opportunities for those who spend a lot of money every year in buying licenses to go out and enjoy recreational fishing. He said some of the proposed areas, for

example the kelp study, may be one that needs to be studied. He fishes the Simpson Reef area a lot and sees a lot of kayakers fishing there, but not a lot of people in boats because of the kelp problem. He said if they need to study kelp, study it, but it shouldn't ban recreational fishermen from those areas. He said there is concern for wave energy taking away coastal areas for fishing. Also, a lot of fishermen are already dodging crab pots that have been left over the years and washed up from storms, so there is a concern for obstacles. He doesn't think that studying should take away from the enjoyment of the Oregon recreational fishermen.

Curt Clay – Coos Bay

Mr. Clay said he doesn't have an oceangoing vessel but he does eat seafood. He said he mostly agreed with the first speaker, but he wanted to remind everyone that they were here because everyone cares about the ocean and the food people get out of the ocean. He said he had collected a few remarks on the Internet and, in general, they seemed to be saying that the impact people have on the ocean ecosystems has been greatly underestimated. He said that when he was younger, a fisherman wouldn't catch a 70-pound swordfish because 70 pounds is too young to have even reproduced. He said now that is considered a good-sized fish that can be legally hunted in the U.S. A few decades ago, a person could get swordfish averaging 300 to 400 pounds close to shore with a harpoon. He said people need to do something and need to think about these issues. He said he wouldn't run through all the comments about the fishery managers voting to shut down commercial salmon fishing in 2006. All the restrictions don't sit well with people, but what are people to do? He said the southern bluefin tuna may be considered an endangered species by the World Conservation Union. People like to eat sharkfin soup, and as a result the population of sharks has plummeted to the point where rays, which the sharks eat, are gobbling up all of the scallops. The scallop industry is suffering. He said it is not technology, but the lack of control of the technology that we should be concerned about. He said that at Bi-Mart one can buy four cans of tuna on sale for \$5, but he can remember when it was \$.33 a can. He said he had just read an article stating the tuna industry is not being careful about packaging and there are a lot of other fish in those cans as well. He said greed and waste will lead to the collapse of these fish. He said there now are trawlers coming around from the Atlantic to fish. People can, as a society, decide to fish the sea in a rational fashion and obtain more benefit. He said, the way out of this crisis is to catch less and pay more, and he as a consumer is willing to pay more, while staying out of critical areas of the ocean.

Leo Naapi - Reedsport

Mr. Naapi said he is member of two watershed councils: Partnership for the Umpqua Rivers and the Smith River Watershed Council. He said the two watershed councils were accomplishing incredible things in creating good fish habitat for spawning. He said unfortunately the results are disappointing. He believed it had to do with predator issues, so he felt there should be more effort looking at predators of salmon and other species. He asked how many people had heard of the term incrementalism. Two Marine Reserves had been established and now they were looking at four more, and two years from now there may be four more proposals, and four years from now there will probably be four more, and before long the whole coast is going to be a Marine Reserve, he said. He discussed the book called "Set Up and Sold Out." He said the author lives in Oregon and has done an excellent job analyzing the "green movement," which includes some organizations the group is hearing from tonight. He read an excerpt: "The green agenda includes working toward crippling and eventually eliminating these industries, cattle industry, timber industry, agriculture industry and fishing industry." He said he believes that is what is going to happen.

Lou Leberti – Coos Bay

Mr. Leberti said he was born and raised in Charleston and his family came to the Charleston area in the early 1870s. He said he was very familiar with the area that is being talked about from the standpoint that his mother and grandmother had collected things from the area already designated a research reserve. He said the area already has been saved because of someone already taking his and his family's ability to gather kelp, kelp eel and other things off of that ground. As a result, he cannot teach his grandchildren the things that his family taught him. He said that represented an economic and historic take-away and he is totally against moving into the ocean with marine reserves. He said he has fished the area for many years, including inside the kelp area. There weren't the number of sea lions, harbor seals and elephant seals that are there now. The fishing inside is not as good as it used to be, because of predators that are not taken anymore. He said he is against any of the reserves because he uses the area as a recreational fisherman and as a young man he commercially fished with his uncle. He said he fished in the South Cove area recently and caught his limit. He commented that preservation was not a good thing because he already cannot do the same things in South Slough he did as a young man due to restrictions.

Bob Borst – Eugene

Mr. Borst said he is a sport fisherman and he is opposed any Marine Reserve in the Cape Arago/Seven Devils area. He said over the years, this process has moved forward and it has become clear to him that the concept of Marine Reserves in Oregon Territorial waters has never been about science, research, protecting an ecosystem or saving an endangered or threatened species. If these factors were an issue, assets would have been allocated to study the areas of Oregon coastal waters that supporters of Marine Reserves claim need to be closed to sustainable yield. Instead, Oregon coastal communities are being pressured to close areas of the ocean to all extraction with no guarantee of money to study them. This process has come down to a very simple debate between those seeking financial or political gain by ending the harvest of natural resources in Oregon Territorial waters and those who wish to maintain a viable fishing and crabbing industry in those waters. He read excerpts from a letter written by the Board of Commissioners in Tillamook County on conditions accepting even a modified Marine Reserve: "ODF&W needs to conduct a comprehensive baseline study. We believe the topic of Marine Reserves is of sufficient importance that they be done right, not expeditiously. ODF&W, in conjunction with the federal government, completes fishery independent yellow eye and canary rock fish surveys that could open up other fishing grounds to help mitigate the economic impacts of the Marine Reserves closures." He said most importantly in his opinion, Oregon should "establish a savings account for funding the Marine Reserves prior to implementation. Without funding, they cannot be implemented. Any Marine Reserve areas under proposal in Oregon first (should) be reviewed by the PFMC prior to implementation." He said the Board of Commissioners of Tillamook County clearly understands the effect of being a small fishing and crabbing cluster in Oregon coastal waters. He said he believed the majority of Reedsport and Winchester Bay residents will agree with them.

Paul Walker – Eugene

Mr. Walker said he had lived and worked in Coos Bay and that he and his wife still own a place there. He said for the past year he had been an alternate representative on the Cape Perpetua team representing recreational fishing. He said he also is a kayaker and a free diver and has subsistence fished and harvested off of Cape Arago and Cape Perpetua. He said he single-hook fishing or breath-hold diving and spear fishing is a reasonable and effective ecosystem management approach. These activities have little impact on fish populations or habitat

diversity, sustainability and people; and the harvest methods have been a part of this nearshore ecosystem in Oregon for more than 10,000 years. He said several times during Cape Perpetua meetings people told him that he would have to find someplace else to fish. He wonders how the State plans to mitigate that for the recreational sport fishermen. He also wants to know how much the Marine Reserves are going to cost, especially facing a \$3 billion state budget shortfall. State employees have to take mandatory furlough days, school district employees have to take mandatory furlough days, they are closing schools, teachers are being laid off, and ODF&W is facing a 13% cut in the general fund and laying off a Roseburg watershed council person, he said. The streams protection program has had its budget cut by more than \$700,000 and seven full-time staff people, and their two-year budget is not on budget this next biennium. He said those programs that are helping restore and enhance ecosystems are going away, right when the state wants to start an experiment to see how Marine Reserves are going to help. He said he wants programs that are effective now and use the public's money in a responsible way. He doesn't feel the Marine Reserves program is a good fit for Oregon and he doesn't want his tax dollars going for it, but would rather have the watershed council position filled and the volunteer teams working on streams continue to work. He would rather have more teachers in the schools teaching his kids, and he would rather have more law enforcement chasing the bad guys than chasing him off the rocks.

Erin Anderson – Portland

Ms. Anderson said she works with the Our Ocean coalition, which is a group of eight marine conservation organizations that don't want fishing to end in Oregon. She firmly believes in the science that says if areas are set aside, especially areas that are really fertile and great nesting grounds, that they will in fact prolong fish populations for fishing for generations to come. She said she appreciated this meeting format and that it was really nice to look at things and have smaller discussions. She said she had attended several of the Port of Coos Bay meetings throughout the last year and a half and as a member of the public it was very frustrating at times to sit there and not be able to say anything or add to the conversation. She said that in order for Marine Reserves and Marine Protected Areas to work there needs to be connectivity. They don't work in isolation, but work as networks or systems. She said there was a Marine Reserve going in down at Red Fish Rocks off of Port Orford and OPAC unanimously approved a potential Marine Reserve and Marine Protected Area at Cape Perpetua, but it's a long way between Cape Perpetua and Red Fish Rocks. She said it makes sense for there to be a Marine Reserve and Marine Protected Area at Cape Arago. She also said the proposals are too small, but felt the solution might be to combine them and have multiple Marine Protected Areas connected to the Cape Arago region. She asked the team to strongly consider some creative connecting of the existing proposals.

Rachel Smith – Eugene

Ms. Smith said she grew up in Central Oregon when there was logging and ranching, but that a lot of the things she loved doing as a child are no longer possible because there are so many people here now. She said she was a dislocated timber worker who has successfully retrained, so she knows what it was like to lose a job to changes in the economy and changes in resources. She felt Oregonians should remember where they came from and how they have treated the land, so that there are resources for future children. She said it was important to think not only about this time right now and the economic difficulties, but to honor all of those who have gone before and cared for the resources, to honor the creatures that have lived here for thousands of years before humans came and who have no voice in these meetings. She felt it was also very important to think in longer-term cycles. People live 50 to 100 years, as do many fish species.

She agreed about connectivity among reserves and felt it was a good idea to cluster reserves in this area to guard the biodiversity and resources. She felt the only way to go forward was to work together and seek out what it is that each person loves and hear from the people with diverse views. She wanted to express gratitude to everyone who put work into the difficult process and was very proud of Americans who work together respectfully and listen to each other. Because of global warming, she felt people should be thinking longer term.

Allen Solomon – Cape Arago

Mr. Solomon said he lives near Bastendorff Beach and is a scientist who has studied global change for the last 30 years for various federal agencies. He said this ecosystem is not nearly as resilient as day-to-day life leads people to believe. He said in 50 years people could have it cleaned out or in 50 years it could be cleaned out by other sources, such as the spread of disease. It is something that people greatly need to know more about. Someone said they want the actions that are effective now, but if we don't know what actions are effective now, he said, we have to learn that. It is critical that if we want a sustainable system, portions of it are set aside for study. He said from what he saw there is very little being set aside and there was almost no blockading of fishing in these proposals. He felt that it was critical to work together and not to put motives into each other's mouths but rather listen to what people are saying.

Mary Narey – Salem

She said she agreed with Rachel Smith's comments.

Laura Schmidt – Portland

Ms. Schmidt said thank you for the chance to give public comment on the Cape Arago Marine Reserve proposal. She said she is a fourth-generation Oregonian raised in Clackamas County and currently a resident of Portland – so she is very much an inland resident. She said she is very proud to be from a beautiful and fertile state, with a history of protecting its natural resources. She said she believes the ocean belongs to everyone and that it is a common resource that should be used and protected as such. She fully supports a very strong network of Marine Reserves and Marine Protected Areas on the Oregon Coast. She said she also believes the proposed reserves in this area are not large enough to protect the rich biodiversity, and, if anything, they should be increased. She said Marine Reserves protect not only the species within but also the entire ecosystems and entire habitats of that area. It is important to protect the great kelp forest and study it, setting aside areas of control unaffected by human extraction but realizing it still would be affected by pollution and/or acidification. She said she would like to see Marine Reserves and Marine Protected Areas supported on the coast and move forward in a very proactive way. She thanked everyone for their time and energy in this process.

Stephen Karakashian – Portland

Mr. Karakashian said he lives in Portland and is a biologist. He said he lived in Oregon in the 1960s and loved it partly because of the wonderful natural environment. He said he was an academic person so he left Oregon for many years. He retired nine years ago and returned because he loved this state, the environment and the ocean. He said he wasn't primarily a marine biologist but he had worked at a marine station, so he had studied some of the issues. He said literature is very clear that in the long run Marine Reserves actually increase biodiversity and the natural productivity of the ocean. He said he wanted to underline what others had said indicating Marine Reserves are part of a network. The larvae and juvenile fish, invertebrates and sometimes adults, are moved by currents up and down, which is why it is important to have the links in the chain; and Cape Arago area is an important link in that chain. He said the chain extends up to

Alaska and down into California. In particular, he said, he supports a Marine Reserve for the *Macrocystis* kelp beds and not just a Marine Protected Area, because kelp beds are nurseries for young fish and invertebrates. He said it's his understanding that proposal C is an effort to compromise between economic and biological needs, but it is nowhere big enough. When a reserve is too small, it ends up not being effective because animals leave the area, losing the protection as they cross the boundary. He said he felt many of the proposals, and at least that proposal in particular, are too small. He also felt it probably wasn't a rich enough area. He said the proposed Gregory Point Marine Protected Area is large enough, but doesn't offer enough protection.

George Barton – Coos Bay

Mr. Barton said Dr. Alan Shanks had prepared a six-part pamphlet and addressed all of the issues in the inshore areas. He recommended that everyone pick up a pamphlet and take it home to read because it may answer all of the questions they have as to why Oregon needs reserves.

Edgar Bowen – Coos Bay

Mr. Bowen, a chief of the Tribal Elders of the Confederated Tribes of the Coos, Lower Umpqua and Siuslaw Indians, said it was interesting to hear people's comments. He said he has lived here a long time and never had any of these problems and now people have all of these problems. He said he could remember the deluge of people who came after 1939. Before that, there were many large fish here, but he hadn't seen those for many years. He said people who have lived among tribal members all these years still don't know anything about them. He said in his neighborhood he knew who the Swedes were, the Indians, the Germans and the Japanese; and it's like the tribal members aren't even here. People don't know who they are and that they have rights. The tribes have gathering rights and intend to stick up for those rights, just like other people stick up for their own rights. He said they would like to see tribal gathering rights guaranteed in this program. He said if it isn't, then others are going to pay his bill to defend his rights because he doesn't have any money. There are things that are called Indian laws and, he said, he hasn't known an Indian yet that ever made a law. White Congressmen have made laws and are proud of them and won't change them. He said he just wants to make sure tribal gathering rights are a part of Marine Reserves. He said he had been to other meetings where they discuss everything, but when minutes are printed they don't note where the territory is or that he has said anything. All the tribes need is a little bit of gathering rights. They don't leave a big imprint and don't fish commercially. They just go out and get mussels, seaweed and a little bit of kelp to make pickles. Don't deny the tribes that, he said.

Mark Tilton – Florence

Mr. Tilton said he was part of the original group that put the Cape Perpetua proposal together to take to OPAC for consideration and he strongly supported the team's final compromise. Team members voted 15-1 for that compromise. He said there was a lot of flexibility and shared intelligence, and he hoped he could see something like that here. He said he felt the Governor and the Legislature had the right concept when they wanted to put in a network of Marine Reserves, and he believes there need to be protected areas at Cape Arago south of Cape Perpetua. Then, going south, the network would connect to the Red Fish Rocks site. He said he is concerned about the size of the Marine Reserve components for Cape Arago, that there will be a problem with providing effective connectivity and that the Marine Reserve components are too small for evaluating their effectiveness. Specifically, the area encompassed by proposals A and G really has a high ecological significance, and it could be combined with proposal C. He asked that the Committee look for every opportunity to increase the Marine Reserve components of

those alternatives. He said he thought it was useful to keep in mind that these are public waters. They are co-owned by everybody and managed as a public trust for the long-term benefit of all current and future generations. Citizens of Oregon have consistently shown their support for setting aside modest areas of natural systems. He said he completely agrees that people don't really understand how marine systems work. He thanked the local team members because they are the ones doing the heavy lifting and he hoped they could come up with a strong majority vote on a final compromise, which would be more likely to be implemented exactly how the committee proposes it.

Laura Smith – Reedsport

Ms. Smith said she supports the reserves as they are proposed, but would prefer them to be bigger. She said Marine Reserves are important because people don't understand ecosystems and what might be missing from them. She said she isn't a marine biologist but that she has gone to the aquarium in Newport, where they have sea otters, and she would like to see sea otters in Oregon. She said there are sea otters in California and in Washington, but there aren't any in Oregon and it was probably because they didn't have a connection in the ecosystem or protected places to live. She said it would be nice to have protected places, not only for sea otters, but to avoid losing existing species. She said it's important to her, because she'd like to have kids someday and have them enjoy the same opportunities she has.

Anita Andazola – Coos Bay

Ms. Andazola said she supports the Marine Reserves proposals but is concerned about the relatively small size. She said a lot of people who work with watershed councils do what they can on their land to increase areas for fish to spawn and to provide holding areas until the fish need to go out to sea. They need those areas where their bodies can change so they can handle the salt water and get big enough to go into the ocean and come back. She said she sees a lot of hard work that people put into getting something on their land to raise the fish and then there is no interface for the fish once they hit the bay. Once they swim into the mouth of the river, they lose a lot of protection. She would like people to consider not just one side of fishery biology, but the whole life cycle, including fishes' needs to get out to the ocean and return.

The meeting adjourned at 8:30 p.m.